

From: Betsaida Alcantara/DC/USEPA/US
Sent: 1/31/2012 7:55:11 PM
To: Bob Perciasepe/DC/USEPA/US@EPA; Bob Sussman/DC/USEPA/US@EPA; Richard Windsor/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
CC: Shawn Garvin/R3/USEPA/US@EPA; Mathy Stanislaus/DC/USEPA/US@EPA; Lisa Feldt/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Subject: Re: Cabot Challenges EPA's Dimock Water Data

Tonight we are sharing our latest Cabot letter with reporters and telling them we're reviewing their latest statement. Region is drafting point by point response which we will all review.

----- Original Message -----

From: Bob Perciasepe
Sent: 01/31/2012 07:51 PM EST
To: Bob Sussman; Richard Windsor
Cc: Shawn Garvin; Mathy Stanislaus; Lisa Feldt; Betsaida Alcantara
Subject: Re: Cabot Challenges EPA's Dimock Water Data

Do we have a draft or a response?

Thanks

Bob Perciasepe

Deputy Administrator

(o)202 564 4711

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

----- Original Message -----

From: Bob Sussman
Sent: 01/31/2012 05:23 PM EST
To: Richard Windsor; Bob Perciasepe
Cc: Shawn Garvin; Mathy Stanislaus; Lisa Feldt; Betsaida Alcantara
Subject: Fw: Cabot Challenges EPA's Dimock Water Data

Ex. 5 - Deliberative

Robert M. Sussman

Senior Policy Counsel to the Administrator

Office of the Administrator

US Environmental Protection Agency

----- Forwarded by Bob Sussman/DC/USEPA/US on 01/31/2012 05:20 PM -----

From: Terri-A White/R3/USEPA/US
To: Garvin.Shawn@epamail.epa.gov, "Betsaida Alcantara" <alcantara.betsaida@epa.gov>
Cc: "Bob Sussman" <Sussman.Bob@epamail.epa.gov>, "William Early" <Early.William@epamail.epa.gov>, "Mick Kulik" <kulik.michael@epa.gov>, "Jennie Saxe" <Saxe.Jennie@epamail.epa.gov>, "Ron Borsellino" <Borsellino.Ron@epamail.epa.gov>, "Dennis Carney" <Carney.Dennis@epamail.epa.gov>
Date: 01/31/2012 03:49 PM
Subject: Fw: Cabot Challenges EPA's Dimock Water Data

FYI.

Sent by EPA Wireless E-Mail Services

From: Laura Legere [llegere@timeshamrock.com]
Sent: 01/31/2012 03:09 PM EST
To: Terri-A White; David Sternberg
Subject: Cabot Challenges EPA's Dimock Water Data

Hi Terri,

Cabot has released a response to the EPA's testing and temporary water deliveries in Dimock in which the company says the data points cited by the agency in its action memo "are out of context, not representative of the volumes of data collected, and in some cases, did not originate from these residences' water wells at all."

The specific arguments are attached in the full memo.

Would you like to respond to Cabot's letter? I would need something by the end of the day.

Thanks,

Laura Legere
Staff Writer
Scranton Times-Tribune
570-348-9100 x 5184
llegere@timeshamrock.com

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **George Stark** <george.stark@cabotog.com>
Date: Tue, Jan 31, 2012 at 2:47 PM
Subject: Cabot Challenges EPA's Dimock Water Data
To: "llegere@timeshamrock.com" <llegere@timeshamrock.com>

Laura,

Below is an executive summary of the Cabot response to the EPA's January 2012 position on water delivery in Dimock. Attached is the full 6-page response doc. All of it will be released and posted later today.

As you are aware Cabot disagrees with EPA's decision to conduct an extensive investigation and to provide water to a select group of landowners on the grounds there is no evidence the well water in question poses a threat to human health. EPA's data points are out of context, not representative of the volumes of data collected, and in some cases, did not originate from these residences' water wells at all. We desire to set the record straight on the relevance of the data and where it came from.

These distortions of fact are summarized below:

- * The U.S. EPA disregarded more recent data that better demonstrates the current conditions of the water wells. Instead, they opted to utilize data from several years ago, including one from November 2008. Less than a handful of the data utilized was collected in 2011.
- * NONE of the data points selected by the U.S. EPA show concentrations for substances (including arsenic, manganese, sodium, glycols and DEHP) in the residences' well water that exceed the Primary Maximum Contaminant Levels set by the U.S. Government.
- * The water sample cited by the U.S. EPA to represent the maximum concentration of arsenic in the Carter water well was NOT taken from the residence's water well - it was from a sample of the Montrose area public water supply from Pennsylvania American Water. All other arsenic values for the Carter water well fall below the PMCL.

- * Many of the data points selected are taken out of context:
 - o The sodium point for the Sautner well water was taken from a post-treatment water sample after having gone through a water softener, which reduces water hardness by replacing calcium and magnesium with sodium and thereby raising the overall sodium concentration. A review of the data shows, as expected, that all of the pre-treatment water samples have sodium concentrations 3-4 times lower than the post-treatment water.
 - o The manganese point for the Sautner well water is nearly three years old and was only one of two samples to be above the Secondary Contaminant Level. The other 43 water samples collected were below this level. Realize there is not PMCL for manganese, only a SMCL.
 - o The sodium point for the Nolan Ely water well was collected 18 months ago and is inconsistent with data collected since September 2010.
- * The Montrose area public water supplied by Pennsylvania American water (which the EPA is currently providing to these residences) contains sodium concentrations well above what the majority of the landowners have in their own water wells.
- * There is neither a Primary Maximum Contaminant Level nor a Secondary Contaminant Level established for sodium.
- * The manganese levels in the four water wells fall within the levels of naturally occurring manganese observed throughout the Susquehanna County area.
- * The glycol levels are well below the ATSDR advisory level referenced by the U.S. EPA.

Please feel free to call if you have additional questions...

George Stark
 Director, External Affairs
 Cabot Oil & Gas Corporation
 (412) 249-3909

[Description: Description: New Image]<<https://twitter.com/#!/CabotOG>>[Description: Description: YouTube]<<http://www.youtube.com/cabotsusquehanna>>[Description: Description: LinkedIn]<<http://www.linkedin.com/in/georgestark1>>[Description: Description: Cabot]<http://www.cabotog.com/comm_susquehanna.html>

[attachment "Cabot Response to EPA Water Data FINAL 1-31.pdf" deleted by Bob Perciasepe/DC/USEPA/US]